



Table 1 A Five-Criteria Framework to Assess the Quality of Parliamentary Bureaucratic Arrangement

Aspect	Grade A	Grade B	Grade C	Grade D	Grade E
1. Leadership	<p>Explicitly Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting all three positive criteria below:</p> <p>(i) the Management Body consists of only Speakers, Government Backbenchers and Opposition Members; independent external members may be appointed.</p> <p>(ii) Appointment of senior officers¹ is controlled by Parliament; and</p> <p>(iii) Removal of and disciplinary actions</p>	<p>Largely Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting two out of the three positive criteria below:</p> <p>(i) the Management Body consists of only Speakers, Government Backbenchers and Opposition Members; independent external members may be appointed.</p> <p>(ii) Appointment of senior officers is controlled by Parliament; and</p> <p>(iii) Removal of and disciplinary actions</p>	<p>Easily dominated by the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting only one out of the three positive criteria below:</p> <p>(i) the Management Body consists of only Speakers, Government Backbenchers and Opposition Members; independent external members may be appointed.</p> <p>(ii) Appointment of senior officers is controlled by Parliament; and</p> <p>(iii) Removal of and disciplinary actions</p>	<p>Substantially dominated by the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) the Management Body is dominated by the Executive appointees including ministers;</p> <p>(ii) Appointment of senior officers is controlled by the Executive; and</p> <p>(iii) Removal of and disciplinary actions against senior officers can be due to arbitrary decision of the</p>	<p>Effectively under the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) There is no distinctive Management Body;</p> <p>(ii) Senior officers are appointed from the general public service; and</p> <p>(iii) Senior officers can be arbitrarily removed.</p>

¹ Senior officers = Clerk(s) of the Parliament and/or the Chief Executive/Administrator.

Aspect	Grade A	Grade B	Grade C	Grade D	Grade E
	against senior officers are governed by rigorous due process.	against senior officers are governed by rigorous due process.	against senior officers are governed by rigorous due process.	Executive.	
2. Administrative Autonomy	<p>Explicitly Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting all positive criteria below:</p> <p>(i) All staff in the parliament are under a separate service.</p> <p>(ii) Parliamentary staff cannot be directed by the Executive regarding parliamentary administration matters.</p> <p>(iii) The Management Body has full power to set the direction and the organisation for the service.</p> <p>(iv) The Management Body has full power to hire and fire its employees.</p>	<p>Largely Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the positive criteria below:</p> <p>(i) All staff in the parliament are under a separate service.</p> <p>(ii) Parliamentary staff cannot be directed by the Executive regarding parliamentary administration matters.</p> <p>(iii) The Management Body has full power to set the direction and the organisation for the service.</p> <p>(iv) The Management Body has full power to hire and fire its employees.</p>	<p>Easily influenced by the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) Part of the staff in the parliament is under a separate service.</p> <p>(ii) Parliamentary staff can be influenced by the Executive regarding parliamentary administration matters.</p> <p>(iii) The Management Body has partial power to set the direction and the organisation for the service.</p> <p>(iv) The Management Body has partial power to hire and fire its employees.</p>	<p>Substantially controlled by the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) A minority part of the staff in the parliament is under a separate service.</p> <p>(ii) Parliamentary staff can be directed by the Executive regarding parliamentary administration matters.</p> <p>(iii) The Executive has full power to set the direction and the organisation for the service.</p> <p>(iv) The Executive has full power to hire and fire its employees.</p>	<p>Effectively under the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) All staff in the parliament are under the general public service.</p> <p>(ii) Parliamentary staff can be directed by the Executive regarding parliamentary administration matters.</p> <p>(iii) The Executive has full power to set the direction and the organisation for the service.</p> <p>(iv) The Executive has full power to hire and fire its employees.</p>

Aspect	Grade A	Grade B	Grade C	Grade D	Grade E
3. Financial Autonomy	<p>Explicitly Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting all three criteria below:</p> <p>(i) The Parliament decides its budget.</p> <p>(ii) The Parliament administers its financial resources</p> <p>(iii) The Parliament owns and administers its property</p>	<p>Largely Independent from the Executive:</p> <p>Meeting two out of the three criteria below:</p> <p>(i) The Parliament decides its budget.</p> <p>(ii) The Parliament administers its financial resources</p> <p>(iii) The Parliament owns and administers its property</p>	<p>Easily influenced by the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) The Parliament proposes its budget, but subject to the Executive approval.</p> <p>(ii) The Parliament partially administers its financial resources subject to the Executive.</p> <p>(iii) The Executive owns the property; the Parliament has limited power to administer its property</p>	<p>Substantially controlled by the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) The Executive decides the budget; the Parliament is being consulted only.</p> <p>(ii) The Executive administers the financial resources; the Parliament is being consulted only.</p> <p>(iii) The Executive owns and administers the property in parliamentary institutions.</p>	<p>Effectively under the Executive:</p> <p>More likely to meet most of the negative criteria below:</p> <p>(i) The Executive decides the budget.</p> <p>(ii) The Executive administers the financial resources</p> <p>(iii) The Executive owns and administers the property in parliamentary institutions.</p>
4. Supportive Services to Private MPs	<p>The legislation requires the parliamentary staff to provide professional assistance to lawmakers in all three aspects: policy study, budget assessment and law drafting.</p>	<p>The legislation requires the parliamentary staff to provide professional assistance to lawmakers in two of the three aspects: policy study, budget assessment and law drafting.</p>	<p>The legislation requires the parliamentary staff to provide professional assistance to lawmakers in one of three aspects: policy study, budget assessment and law drafting.</p>	<p>-</p>	<p>The legislation does not require the parliamentary staff to provide professional assistance to lawmakers in all three aspects: policy study, budget assessment and law drafting.</p>

Aspect	Grade A	Grade B	Grade C	Grade D	Grade E
5. Public Accountability	<p>Very Strong Accountability</p> <p>Meeting all three criteria below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record Keeping and publication Publication of annual report Requirement of Periodical Review 	<p>Strong Accountability</p> <p>Meeting two out of three criteria below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record Keeping and publication Publication of annual report Requirement of Periodical Review 	<p>Fair Accountability</p> <p>Meeting one out of three criteria below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record Keeping and publication Publication of annual report Requirement of Periodical Review 	<p>Weak Accountability</p> <p>Meeting one out of three criteria below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record Keeping Publication of annual report Requirement of Periodical Review 	<p>Very Weak Accountability</p> <p>Meeting none of the criteria below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record Keeping Publication of annual report Requirement of Periodical Review

Table 2 Assessment of and Suggestions for the Proposed PSA 2025 Bill under the Five-Criteria Framework

Aspect	Grade	Weaknesses	Suggestions
1. Leadership	D	<p>The Council is substantially dominated by the governing parties. The selection method for the Council member for the six parliamentary members under section 3(2)(e) and (f) is unclear. No prohibition for a Minister to sit in the Council. No guarantee for representatives from the Opposition</p> <p>The Clerks of Dewan Rakyat and Dewan Negara are appointed by YDPA upon the advice of the Cabinet, without a clear process and grounds for their removal, effectively denying them job security and making them vulnerable to Executive influence.</p> <p>The Chief Administrator is from among the members of the general civil service.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> A balanced and multi-partisan representation with Opposition MPs and Government backbenchers in the Parliamentary Service Council, with a clearly-defined selection method. Appointment of the Clerks of Dewan Rakyat and Dewan Negara by the YDPA upon the recommendation of the Dewan Rakyat Speaker and Dewan Negara President, or the Council, with clearly defined grounds and due processes for their removal. Placing the Chief Administrator in the parliamentary service after s/he assumes the office.

Aspect	Gred	Weaknesses	Suggestions
2. Administrative Autonomy	C	<p>The staff/division/department covered under the parliamentary service is not clearly defined.</p> <p>In the short to medium term, it is likely that the parliamentary workforce will still be primarily staffed by public servants..</p> <p>It is unclear whether the Council has sufficient powers to develop, re-organize and/or expand the service provided under the parliamentary institution.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Placing all parliamentary workforce under the parliamentary service, or at least explicitly listing most departments in the parliamentary under the parliamentary service. 2. Conferring the Council the power to develop, re-organize and/or expand the function of the parliamentary service provided under the parliamentary institution.
3. Financial Autonomy	C	<p>The Council is not given the power to determine or propose its budget.</p> <p>The financial resources are under the control of a member from the general civil service.</p> <p>The Council is not corporatised to own and manage property within the parliament compound.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Conferring the Council the power to decide budgetary allocation, or at least, to review the allocations and propose to the Executive adequate allocations. 2. Appointing the Controlling Officer (in charge of finance) only from the parliamentary service. 3. Effective and accountable mechanisms for parliament to manage its assets.
4. Supportive Services to Private MPs	E	<p>There is no express provision for supporting services such as the Parliamentary Library and Research Service (existent), Parliamentary Budget Office and Parliamentary Draftsman Office.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Express provisions for: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Parliament Library and Research Service, b. Parliamentary Budget Office, and c. Parliamentary Draftsman Office.
5. Public Accountability	D	<p>The Council is neither required to publish its annual report and accounts, decisions and meeting minutes nor subject to any review mechanism.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Publication of the Council's annual reports, decisions and meeting minutes. 2. A review mechanism through the PSA2025 or under the Standing Orders.

Table 3 Comparison between the PSA 1963, status quo and the Proposed PSA 2025 Bill

Aspect	PSA 1963 Grade	1992- now Grade	PSA 2025 Grade
1. Leadership	C	E	D
2. Administrative Autonomy	C	E	C
3. Financial Autonomy	C	E	C
4. Supportive Services to Private MPs	E	E	E
5. Public Accountability	E	E	D